



**GLEN EIRA CITY COUNCIL**

**ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING**

**WEDNESDAY 8 NOVEMBER 2023**

**MINUTES**

**Meeting was held in the Council Chambers,  
Corner Hawthorn & Glen Eira Roads, Caulfield  
at 7.30pm**

Present

The Mayor, Councillor Jim Magee  
Councillor Tony Athanasopoulos  
Councillor Anne-Marie Cade  
Councillor Margaret Esakoff  
Councillor Sam Parasol  
Councillor Sue Pennicuik  
Councillor Li Zhang  
Councillor Simone Zmood  
Councillor David Zyngier

## INDEX

<b>1.</b>	<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>2.</b>	<b>APOLOGIES.....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS ON THE AGENDA .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>5.</b>	<b>RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS .....</b>	<b>17</b>
	Nil	
<b>6.</b>	<b>REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS .....</b>	<b>17</b>
	Nil	
<b>7.</b>	<b>REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY .....</b>	<b>18</b>
	<b>7.1 Advisory Committees .....</b>	<b>18</b>
	7.1.1 Advisory Committee Minutes.....	18
	<b>7.2 Records of Assembly.....</b>	<b>18</b>
	7.2.1 Records of Assemblies of Councillors .....	18
<b>8.</b>	<b>OFFICER REPORTS (AS LISTED).....</b>	<b>18</b>
	8.1 Financial Management Report (30 September 2023) .....	18
	8.2 Planning Scheme Review 2023.....	19
	8.3 Compliance with Condition 38 of the Planning Permit for 10-16 Selwyn Street Elsternwick .....	19
	8.4 Glen Huntly Major Activity Centre - Request for Authorisation of Proposed Planning Controls.....	20
	8.5 Nature Strip Planting Guidelines - 2023 Revision .....	21
	8.6 Community Grants Policy Review .....	21
	8.7 Youth Engagement.....	21
	8.8 Inclusion of 4 Trees in the Classified Tree Register.....	22
	8.9 Porter Road Park - Updated Concept & Community Engagement Summary.....	22
	8.10 Mackie Road Reserve Playspace - Updated Concept & Community Engagement Summary.....	23
	8.11 Sale of Council Land Abutting 204 Centre Road Bentleigh.....	23
	8.12 Appointment of Members to the Strategic Transport Advisory Committee .....	24

8.13	VCAT Watch .....	24
8.14	Appointment of Acting Chief Executive Officer .....	24
<b>9.</b>	<b>URGENT BUSINESS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>10.</b>	<b>ORDINARY BUSINESS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
10.1	Requests for reports from a member of Council staff .....	25
10.2	Right of reply .....	25
10.3	Notice of Motion .....	25
10.4	Councillor questions.....	25
10.5	Written public questions to Council .....	25
<b>11.</b>	<b>CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS .....</b>	<b>25</b>
	Nil	
<b>12.</b>	<b>CLOSURE OF MEETING.....</b>	<b>26</b>



## 1. **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

The Mayor read the acknowledgement.

Glen Eira City Council Acknowledges the peoples of the Kulin Nation as Traditional Owners and Custodians, and pay our respect to their Elders past, present and emerging. We Acknowledge and uphold their continuing relationship to land and waterways. Council extends its respect to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples.

## 2. **APOLOGIES**

### Apology

**Moved: Cr Magee**

**Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That the apology from Cr Athanasopoulos and Cr Zyngier be received and noted.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

## 3. **REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS ON THE AGENDA**

Councillors were reminded of the requirement for disclosure of conflicts of interest in relation to items listed for consideration on the Agenda, or any item that was considered at this meeting, in accordance with Section 130(2) of the *Local Government Act 2020* and Rule 60(3) of the Glen Eira City Council Governance Rules. Councillors were then invited to indicate any such conflict of interest.

Nil

**Procedural Motion****Moved: Cr Magee****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council:

1. where meetings are held in-person, can continue the meeting if the livestream of the meeting fails as stated in the governance rules;
2. considers the meeting to be adjourned for 10 minutes from the commencement of any technical problem where a Councillor is participating virtually; and
3. where a Councillor is participating virtually and the meeting cannot be resumed within 30 minutes from the commencement of the technical problem, the meeting is to be reconvened on Thursday 9 November 2023 at 5.30pm.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY****Public Participation:**

This evening we had 14 submitters request to speak to Council during Public Participation. Due to the extended time limit of 30 minutes, 9 speakers were able to speak to Council during Public Participation.

**Change Order of Business****Moved: Cr Magee****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council changes the order of business to bring forward Item 10.5 – Written Public Questions to Council to be heard at this stage of the meeting.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY****Written Public Questions to Council:**

This evening we had 92 Written Public Questions submitted to Council. 24 questions were able to read and responded to during the 30 minute timeframe provided.

The minutes display those questions that were read and responded to during the Council meeting. All 92 questions will receive a formal response in writing.

**Written Public Questions to Council**

<p><b>Hayden Lavigne</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 1:</u></b></p> <p>When will works begin to investigate &amp;, ideally build, a safe bike connection between Boyd Park &amp; Urban Forest Reserve as identified as Action 1.6 of Councils 2019-2024 Cycling Action Plan?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>At this stage we do not have a clear timeframe for that project. Council's Cycling Action Plan was adopted before the impacts of the Coronavirus Pandemic. Due to the financial impacts of the pandemic, Council has reprioritised the immediate actions. Council's current priority project for walking and cycling is the extension to the Rosstown Rail Trail.</p>
<p><b>Markus Oswald</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 2:</u></b></p> <p>As part of agenda item 8.4 - Glen Huntly Major Activity Centre - Request for Authorisation of Proposed Planning Controls, it is proposed that heritage overlay HO113 be removed from 122 Grange Road. The former post office at corner of Grange and Glen Huntly Roads is of historical significance and important landmark. The site is proposed to have a 6 story discretionary height limit. Is the heritage review of the site by independent consultants mentioned in the agenda publicly available?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>A copy of the heritage review that supports the removal of HO113 from 122 Grange Road will be included if the documents that are made available as part of the public exhibition stage of the planning scheme amendment.</p>
<p><b>Mia Olerhead</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 3:</u></b></p> <p>In regard to the issue concerning the closure of the ELCs, where is Council's analysis that its three ELC's are subject to the competitive neutrality policy? For instance, is council running a "significant business activity" given it only services 2% of ELC services. How does this council know if it meets the requirements to invoke CNP?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The application of Competitive Neutrality Policy (CNP) to the operation of the Early Learning Centres is one of a number of considerations that must be taken into account by Council when making its final decision. If Council's final decision is that it will continue to operate the three Early Learning Centres, or any of them, then it will then observe CNP in</p>

	<p>implementing that decision. That is, Council's approach to pricing for the service.</p> <p>An activity should not be regarded as significant or insignificant solely because of its size relative to the number of like services in the municipality. A variety of factors informs that assessment. Council has assessed the Early Learning Centres through this lens and is satisfied that they are a 'significant business activity' for the purposes of CNP.</p>
<p><b>Sam Wood</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 4:</u></b></p> <p>Has Council approached external providers enquiring whether they would be interested in running the service on behalf of council? If not, why not? If so, what was the response?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>No. Council has not approached any external providers to run the service. Council has made a preliminary decision, not a final decision to exit direct service provision from the three centres. Council is now considering all submissions received during the 4-week consultation process prior to a final decision being made on the 12 December 2023. Once Council has determined what its own role should be in the delivery of long day care other options can be explored.</p>
<p><b>Esther Gyorki</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 5:</u></b></p> <p>In the discussion paper and in various other documents and conversations, the council and councillors have all emphasised that they will 'genuinely consider individual feedback'. Knowing the volumes of feedback that you have received and being quite certain that all individual feedback that has been received is 100% against the proposed decision, if you make the decision to close the centres, what will be the deciding factors that you obviously consider more important than the voice of your own community members?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Council will consider all submissions and feedback received as part of the 4-week consultation process. This feedback will inform the final decision, however other important considerations as outlined in the Childcare Discussion Paper, published 5 October 2023, include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Council's role and responsibility as a local government and a service provider in a competitive market</li> <li>• the financial viability of Council-operated Early Learning Centres</li> <li>• opportunities and challenges relating to the existing childcare infrastructure.</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• an assessment of possible options for future service delivery</li> <li>• capacity of the local childcare marketplace to meet current and future demand</li> </ul>
<b>Esther Gyorki</b> <b>Carnegie</b>	<p><b><u>Questions 6:</u></b></p> <p>On 12 December, if you do decide to close the centres by the end of the year – what is your step by step plan for helping 100 + families finding comparable childcare places? Comparable being the same standard (e.g., exceeding standards, reasonable distance from home, aligned values and culturally appropriate). Will you call these centres, book tours, organise paperwork, trial days, orientation days/hours before the Christmas break?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Our Family Liaison Officers are working closely with individual families to provide support now, and to understand the type of support families may require to identify alternative care that best suits their individual needs if Council does make a final decision to close its Early Learning Centres.</p> <p>We now have a clearer understanding of vacancies after advising other childcare services of Council’s preliminary decision, however Council cannot guarantee specific days, times or locations will be available to suit families’ individual needs.</p> <p>Of the 55 non-Council childcare centres operating in Glen Eira, 20 are rated as ‘Exceeding’ National Quality Standards and 23 are rated as ‘Meeting’ National Quality Standards. 52 of these centres also offer a State-funded kindergarten program for eligible three and four-year-old children. This means that at least 78 per cent of services meet the quality standards set by the Commonwealth Government, and over 1/3 (or 36 per cent) of services exceed the Commonwealth’s standards.</p>
<b>Jonathan Goldsmith</b> <b>Ormond</b>	<p><b><u>Questions 7:</u></b></p> <p>Why has the Mayor and other Councillors refused to attend meetings with Local State and Federal MPs who state there is government funding available?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The Mayor and Councillors have not refused to attend such meetings. The Mayor has both met and spoken with a range of State and Federal Members of Parliament. Council has also received submissions from State and Federal Members of Parliament that were received during the 4-week consultation process. This feedback will be considered by Council, prior to making a final decision on 12 December 2023.</p>



<p><b>Dora Banyasz</b> <b>Ormond</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 8:</u></b></p> <p>Will you make available to us the profit and loss statements and breakdown of costs including your book entry for rent regarding the ELCs, given cost is a key decision factor? If not, why not?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>No. This information is commercially sensitive and is therefore commercial in confidence. Council childcare services operate in a competitive marketplace and there are 58 childcare centres that operate in the municipality.</p>
<p><b>Anna Clarke</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 9:</u></b></p> <p>If there is such a demand for kindergarten places that other centres are offering Saturday places to meet demand, why is Council considering reducing a much needed and in demand service?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Demand for kindergarten places is different to demand for childcare places. The reference to Saturday kindergarten places concerns places in stand-alone kindergartens, not childcare centres.</p> <p>Council's childcare places account for only 2% of the places in Glen Eira and the modelling undertaken as part of the strategic service review concluded that there is likely to be sufficient supply of childcare places to meet current and future demand.</p>
<p><b>Kate Vrljic</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 10:</u></b></p> <p>Why didn't the preliminary decision accord a higher level of importance to quality, at the very least, equal to the budget? Why did the report driving this initial decision fail to consider the wide-ranging implications of closing three centers that exceed National Quality Standards, especially in terms of their impact on children, families, and the community and why does the Council not prioritize QUALITY in childcare (rather than quantity) within its community, essentially compelling parents to accept lower-quality centers?</p> <p>Note: A response that merely acknowledges the quality of the centers (as per report) or states that the final decision is pending is inadequate.</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The Childcare Service review found that we provide quality care and have excellent educators, but our buildings are outdated and lack many of the basic amenities such as kitchens that many families</p>

	<p>expect, and newer centres offer. More information about the challenges associated with our buildings can be found in the Childcare Viability Explained document published 26 October 2023, which is available on the Council website at:  <a href="https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare">https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare</a></p> <p>Childcare places in the municipality have doubled since 2010 and grown by 44.51 per cent since 2019 while the number of children aged under four has dropped by almost 10 per cent since 2016. There are now 58 childcare centres operating in the municipality.</p> <p>A total of 43 non-Council centers in Glen Eira are currently rated as either meeting or exceeding the National Quality Guidelines. Twenty centres have the same 'exceeding' rating as the Council run services. The Glen Eira municipality has childcare choice, capacity and quality which means current and projected demand for childcare can be met.</p>
<p><b>Ryan Beer</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 11:</u></b></p> <p>At the Council Ordinary Meeting on 17 October the Council advised that a copy of the 'strategic service review' report which basis of the discussion paper used to inform Council's preliminary decision to close three ELCs would be made available to the public. On 26 October we received an email update about the preliminary decision. The email provided a selection of information similar format to the Discussion Paper without a copy of the full Strategic Service Review report. What is Council hiding and when will a copy of the full Strategic Service Review report be released?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The full Strategic Service Review contains material that is commercially sensitive and is commercial in confidence and will not be released to the public.</p>
<p><b>Ryan Beer</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 12:</u></b></p> <p>Council Officers have recommended a two-step process to determine the future of the ELCs. Firstly, recommending the closure and then secondly recommending a future review to determine the use of the sites or the sale of the sites. Adopting a two-step process limits the options available for the second step that include continuous operation of the ELC services.</p> <p>Why has a recommendation for the future use of the sites not been resolved as part of the Council officers report?</p> <p>This would provide transparency to Glen Eira residents and the Councillors and ensure the ultimate outcome for the sites provides the most value to the Glen Eira community.</p>

	<p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>In order for Council to consider options about the future of the Early Learning Centres, including the buildings where the services are delivered, it must first decide what its future role will be as a childcare service provider.</p> <p>Council needs to consider the future use of the facilities in accordance with Council's Property Strategy to determine how to most effectively use buildings that are no longer required for their current use. <u>The current use is for <b>Council-operated childcare</b></u>. Council could consider options such as leasing, re-purposing or disposal of the sites. The option of leasing Council assets to a not-for-profit or parent committee to operate a childcare service could form part of the consideration for the future use of the assets.</p> <p>Council decision making to inform the future of the three childcare assets has been previously answered in the Preliminary Decision about Council's Early Learning Centres Your Questions Answered published on 20 October 2023. Which can be found at: <a href="https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare">https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare</a></p>
<p><b>Emiko Hunt</b> <b>Caulfield</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 13:</u></b></p> <p>The Local Government Act states: "Participants in community engagement must have access to objective, relevant and timely information to inform their participation." 5 October: Families informed of closures. 13 October: Council provided non-transparent information based off questions from 5 October meeting. Took 8 days to provide information. 20 October: Council provided information. Took 15 days (since start of 'consultation process') for relevant information to be shared. 1 November: Consultation ended. Parents were not provided objective/relevant information from the beginning of the consultation process. Council took 15 days (20 Oct) to provide relevant required information (and there's still gaps in information). The 1 November end date for community consultation failed to meet the requirement of providing information in a timely manner. Information to date is still largely irrelevant due to lack of transparency. How does Council justify its failure to meet the Local Government Act's requirements to provide objective/relevant/timely information?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Information that was considered to inform Council's preliminary decision can be found in the agenda, minutes and Council report for the Special Council Meeting held on Tuesday 3 October 2023: <a href="#">3 October Special Meeting of Council</a>. This includes the information that can be provided from the strategic service review which has been published in the <a href="#">Childcare Discussion Paper on 5 October 2023</a>. Information that is commercial in confidence cannot be released.</p>

	<p>Additional information has also been made available to families, staff and the community to help them understand the information that Council considered before making a preliminary decision, including <a href="#">Your Questions Answered – Family Briefing – 5 October published on 13 October 2023</a>; <a href="#">Your Questions Answered 20 October published on 20 October 2023</a>; and <a href="#">Childcare Viability Explained published on 26 October 2023</a>. All of these documents are available on the Council website.</p> <p>Council is confident it has met all requirements to undertake a genuine consultation and engagement process in accordance with the Local Government Act and Glen Eira’s Community Engagement Strategy and Policy.</p>
<p><b>Jeremy Koadlow</b> <b>Caulfield</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 14:</u></b></p> <p>Following this 4-week consultation period, how do Councillors now feel shutting down services which they now know are the best run ELCs in Glen Eira?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The quality of care and education provided at our centres has never been in question.</p> <p>As consultation only closed last week Councillors are yet to personally review all of the submissions in order to inform their view, however this will occur before the final decision is made on 12 December.</p>
<p><b>Andrew Bolger</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 15:</u></b></p> <p>Regarding the amount Council says it costs to support the Centres currently, which they forecast to increase: Where is the financial responsibility for continuing to run at such a loss and why hasn't anything been done about it?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Each year senior Council early years staff undertake a financial and service model review to ensure the three centres operate as efficiently as possible and this is primarily driven by two key needs – compliance with the Quality Standards, and the needs of families which is informed through the annual enrolment process. This means the use of rooms and staff needs to reflect the children’s age groups that are enrolled in any given year.</p> <p>Whilst the three centres are operating at a loss of \$570K, the senior staff have significant experience operating centres and are confident the centres are running as efficiently as possible whilst also ensuring</p>

	<p>they deliver Exceeding National Quality Standard ratings which the families enjoy and have provided feedback about.</p> <p>The service review was undertaken in response to the ageing buildings, financial losses, the growing childcare market in the municipality, and the current and emerging State and Commonwealth early years reform agendas. This included declining utilization rates and increasing costs.</p> <p>Amid increasing costs and economic uncertainty, it is becoming more difficult for councils to run services. Council undertakes regular reviews of its services to ensure it makes responsible choices now and ensure its services provides value to the community.</p>
<b>Ebonie Martello</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b>	<p><b><u>Questions 16:</u></b></p> <p>Were factors such as unique needs of local families and the potential advantages of small centres, like lower staff turnover, given adequate consideration in the preliminary decision-making process? If not. why not?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Yes. The service review found that we provide quality care and have excellent educators, however the review also found that our small and ageing Early Learning Centre buildings are no longer fit for purpose because they prevent Council from achieving the economies of scale required to operate financially viable childcare services. This is primarily due to the small room sizes and educator to child ratios required by the Commonwealth Government's National Quality Framework.</p> <p>More information about the challenges of our ageing assets can be found at in the Childcare Viability Explained publication, published on 26 October 2023, and is available on the Council website at: <a href="https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare">https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare</a></p>
<b>Ebonie Martello</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b>	<p><b><u>Questions 17:</u></b></p> <p>Does the community and/or impacted families get a copy of the community consultation documents that will be submitted to the Councillors before the final decision is made on 12 December?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Yes. The papers for the 12 December 2023 Council meeting will be published on Council's website on Thursday 7 December 2023.</p>
<b>Ashlee Hope</b> <b>Malvern East</b>	<p><b><u>Questions 18:</u></b></p> <p>Could you provide specific evidence or details regarding the</p>

	<p>educational activities that are asserted to be infeasible in small day-care centres that already exceed national quality standards?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Council competes with 55 other childcare centres in Glen Eira. Larger centres are able to offer additional activities that Council cannot provide because of the size of Council's small centres. Some examples include yoga, music and dance.</p>
<p><b>Ashlee Hope</b> <b>Malvern East</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 19:</u></b></p> <p>Glen Eira's Community Wellbeing Plan (written by Council) also states that "Early childhood (birth–six years) sets the foundation for a child's long-term development and learning ... Investing in the early years of a child's life is crucial, as these years have a significant impact on the child's future physical, psychological and emotional wellbeing." Given the above, what does Council think the impact of uprooting children who have settled into the care of educators, and who have become accustomed to the environment will feel when they are promptly dumped from these places?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Feedback received about the potential timing of the closure of Council's centres, and feedback received about support that families and children may require to transition to an alternative centre will be considered before Council makes a final decision.</p>
<p><b>Amanda Smith</b> <b>Caulfield South</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 20:</u></b></p> <p>Council has stated that it identifies a shortfall in kindergarten places for Glen Eira municipality in 2028, but only in Bentleigh and McKinnon. This was done as part of the KISP (Kindergarten Infrastructure and services plan). However, this assumption was made on the basis that Glen Eira's 0 to 4-year-old population is expected to increase by 1,700 children between 2016 and 2036. This is completely incorrect. The discussion paper attached to this preliminary decision states there will be an increase of 3111 children in the municipality between 2021 and 2036. As the KISP is clearly incorrect and has underestimated the increase in 0-4 population by 1411 children, why are Council considering reducing the number of places available across the region by closing the centres when there is clearly a much greater demand than council projections?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Council supported the development of the Glen Eira KISP that was led</p>

	<p>by the Victorian Department of Education. The current KISP was developed in 2021-2022 before the most recent Census was conducted so some of the information now needs to be updated, which Council will do in partnership with the Victorian Government - Council is waiting for the Victorian Government to confirm a date for this.</p> <p>However, the KISP only reflects kindergarten demand and supply.</p> <p>Demand for kindergarten places is different to demand for childcare places.</p> <p>Specific modelling was undertaken as part of the strategic services review which concluded that Council's childcare places account for only 2% of the places in Glen Eira and the modelling undertaken as part of the strategic service review concluded that there is likely to be sufficient supply of childcare places to meet current and future demand.</p> <p>Further information about current and future demand for places including population projections can be found in the Childcare Discussion Paper published on 5 October 2023, available on the Council website at: <a href="https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare">https://www.haveyoursaygleneira.com.au/childcare</a></p>
<p><b>Amanda Smith</b> <b>Caulfield South</b></p>	<p><b><u>Questions 21:</u></b></p> <p>The Kindergarten Infrastructure Services plan, assumes "kindergarten places currently available are retained into the future and it does not factor in a reduction in kindergarten places due to ageing infrastructure or sites that are not fit-for-purpose into the future... Council considers that funding to renew or replace existing infrastructure will be required to maintain current supply of kindergarten places". The question is in two parts: If the KISP modelling assumes no reduction in kindergarten places, why would a decision to close be made if this reduces the places available by 43 funded kindergarten places? Secondly, if Council identified this requirement to renew or replace infrastructure, why has infrastructure been allowed to languish, knowing full-well that renewal of infrastructure will be required to maintain the current supply of kindergarten places in future?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The Kindergarten Infrastructure Service Plan examines the number of kindergarten places available across the municipality which are provided by BOTH stand-alone kindergartens and childcare centres.</p> <p>As highlighted in the service review there has been a substantial increase in the number of childcare places available in Glen Eira including kindergarten places provided through new centres.</p> <p>There is also growth forecast with nine new Early Learning Centres in the planning phase which have the capacity to provide 919 more</p>

	<p>places.</p> <p>For Glen Eira, the current Kindergarten Infrastructure and Services Plan does not identify a shortfall in kindergarten places for the Glen Eira municipality until 2028, and the shortfall in kindergarten places is expected in Bentleigh-McKinnon; not the suburbs where Council's Early Learning Centres are located.</p> <p>Council Early Learning Centres has not been allowed to languish. For the year 2022-23 the maintenance cost across these centres was \$144,408.99, an increase of 7% on the previous year. This issue regarding viability is associated with ageing design and layout of the centres which is why consolidating services onto a single site at an estimated cost of approx. \$10M was considered as an option as part of the service review.</p>
<p><b>Lisa Perri</b> <b>Carnegie</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 22:</u></b></p> <p>The Vic Department of Education has claimed to have reached out to Council to discuss providing financial assistance. Why has this not been taken up?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>The Department of Education has not contacted Council with an offer to provide financial assistance to operate its three Council run Early Learning Centres.</p>
<p><b>Natalie Parker</b> <b>Murrumbeena</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 23:</u></b></p> <p>Has council turned its mind to whether closing its 3 ELC's comply with its obligations under the Charter of Human Rights?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>When Council makes a decision, it is required to have regard to the rights recognised by the Charter of Human Rights and Responsibilities Act 2006 (the Charter). Council is satisfied that a final decision to cease operating the Early Learning Centres would not limit the rights recognised by the Charter.</p>
<p><b>Nadia Moretti</b> <b>Ormond</b></p>	<p><b><u>Question 24:</u></b></p> <p>Council have tried to shift all the responsibility for Aged Care Services to other levels of government and now it is trying to do the same with Early Learning Services. It is expected that Council will next try and shift all the responsibility for Maternal and Child Health Services to other</p>



	<p>levels of government? Why does Council refuse to take responsibility for any of the services that are vital for the vulnerable people of our community?</p> <p><b><u>Answer:</u></b></p> <p>Childcare services operate in a competitive market-driven sector which has grown significantly in recent years. There are now 58 childcare centres operating in the municipality. The number of places available across the municipality has almost doubled since 2010 and increased by 44.51% per cent since 2019 – an increase from 3,966 places to 5,731 places.</p> <p>The service review concluded there is now a strong supply of childcare places in the Glen Eira municipality and there is a high degree of confidence that this supply will meet current and future demand for childcare places across the municipality.</p> <p>The Commonwealth Government has adopted a market driven system for childcare services and does not directly fund operations and service delivery costs. The Commonwealth Government provides subsidies to benefit families and carers.</p> <p>By comparison, Council is the only provider of Maternal and Child Health Services in the municipality. Maternal and Child Health operations and costs of service delivery are part funded by the State Government through service level agreement with Council. Council has no plans to exit Maternal and Child Health Services.</p>
--	---

#### 4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS

**Moved: Cr Cade**

**Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That the minutes of the Ordinary Council Meeting held on 17 October 2023 be confirmed.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

#### 5. RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS

Nil

#### 6. REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS

Nil

**7. REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY**

---

**7.1 Advisory Committees**

---

**7.1.1 ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES****Moved: Cr Parasol****Seconded: Cr Pennicuik**

That the minutes of the Advisory Committee meetings as shown below be received and noted and that the recommendations of these Committees be adopted.

1. Glen Eira Business and Economy Advisory Committee Minutes 21 September 2023;
2. Community Grants and Awards Advisory Committee Minutes 10 October 2023; and
3. Glen Eira Sustainability Advisory Committee Minutes – 23 August 2023.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**7.2 Records of Assembly**

---

**7.2.1 RECORDS OF ASSEMBLIES OF COUNCILLORS****Moved: Cr Zhang****Seconded: Cr Pennicuik**

That the Records of Assemblies as shown below be received and noted.

1. 3 October 2023 Assembly;
2. 10 October 2023 Assembly; and
3. 17 October 2023 Pre-meeting.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**8. OFFICER REPORTS (AS LISTED)**

---

**8.1 FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT REPORT (30 SEPTEMBER 2023)**

---

**Moved: Cr Cade****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council notes the Financial Management Report for the period ending 30 September 2023.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.2 PLANNING SCHEME REVIEW 2023**

---

**Moved: Cr Esakoff****Seconded: Cr Cade**

That Council:

- endorses the Glen Eira Planning Scheme Review November 2023, and
- provides a copy of the Glen Eira Planning Scheme Review November 2023 to the Minister for Planning for approval.

For the Motion: Crs Esakoff, Magee, Cade, Parasol and Zhang (5)

Against the Motion: Crs Zmood and Pennicuik (2)

**CARRIED****Procedural Motion to Defer Item 8.3****Moved: Cr Zmood**

That Council delay consideration of Item 8.3 until the next OCM on 28 November 2023 so that the Councillor who requested the report can be present.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.3 COMPLIANCE WITH CONDITION 38 OF THE PLANNING PERMIT FOR 10-16 SELWYN STREET ELSTERNWICK**

---

**RECOMMENDATION**

That Council:

1. notes the report.
2. notes Condition 38 of Planning Permit GE/DP-34187/2021 has been satisfied and discharged.

**DEFERRED**

---

**8.4 GLEN HUNTLY MAJOR ACTIVITY CENTRE - REQUEST FOR AUTHORISATION OF PROPOSED PLANNING CONTROLS**

---

**Moved: Cr Esakoff****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council:

1. endorses Schedule 14 to Clause 43.02 Design and Development Overlay (Attachment 1 to this report);
2. endorses the proposed rezoning of land at 1072-1074, 1102 and 1104 Glenhuntly Road and part 103 Grange Road;
3. endorses the application of an Environmental Audit Overlay of land at 1072-1074, Glenhuntly Road;
4. endorses the removal of HO112 (Glen Huntly Railway Station) and HO113 (122 Grange Road);
5. seeks authorisation from the Minister for Planning to prepare an amendment to the Glen Eira Planning Scheme in accordance with Section 8A of the Planning and Environment Act 1987;
6. notes that if authorisation is received from the Minister for Planning, Council exhibits the proposed amendment in accordance with Section 19 of the Planning and Environment Act 1987;
7. authorises the Manager City Futures to undertake minor changes to the Amendment, including changes requested by the Minister for Planning or the Department of Transport and Planning to receive authorisation, where changes do not affect the purpose or intent of the Amendment; and
8. authorises the Manager City Futures to undertake changes to the Amendment to include proposed heritage places and precincts previously endorsed by Council as part of Amendment C252glen and which are located within the Glenhuntly Activity Centre boundary into Amendment C221glen (these places will be transferred from Amendment C252glen).

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.5 NATURE STRIP PLANTING GUIDELINES - 2023 REVISION**

---

**Moved: Cr Zmood****Seconded: Cr Pennicuik**

That Council endorses the final Nature Strip Planting Guidelines 2023 as shown in Attachment 1 of this report.

For the Motion: Crs Magee, Zhang, Zmood and Pennicuik (4)

Against the Motion: Crs Esakoff, Cade and Parasol (3)

**CARRIED**

---

**8.6 COMMUNITY GRANTS POLICY REVIEW**

---

**Moved: Cr Esakoff****Seconded: Cr Parasol**

That Council adopts the reviewed and amended Community Grants Policy 2023 (Attachment 2).

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.7 YOUTH ENGAGEMENT**

---

**Moved: Cr Zhang****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council:

1. Approves the implementation of the Glen Eira Youth Engagement Team as an alternative approach to the Youth Advisory Committee.
2. Endorses the Youth Engagement Team - Implementation Plan contained in Attachment 2.
3. Discontinues the Youth Advisory Committee.
4. Communicates the decision with the members of the Youth Advisory Committee and thanks them for their contribution.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.8 INCLUSION OF 4 TREES IN THE CLASSIFIED TREE REGISTER**

---

**Moved: Cr Zmood****Seconded: Cr Parasol**

That Council:

1. includes the following trees in the Classified Tree Register:
  - a) Willow Myrtle (*Agonis flexuosa*) located at 6 Goe St, Caulfield South – 267/CTR/2021;
  - b) Lemon Scented Gum x 2 (*Corymbia citriodora*) located at 6 Goe St, Caulfield South – 267/CTR/2021;
  - c) Brittle Gum (*Eucalyptus mannifera*) located in Virginia Reserve, East Boundary Rd, Bentleigh East – 457/CTR/2022;
2. notifies each person who nominated a tree detailed in this report;
3. notifies all relevant landholders of the trees detailed in this report; and
4. authorises a notice to be published in the Victorian Government Gazette of the decision to include the trees outlined in this report in the Classified Tree Register.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.9 PORTER ROAD PARK - UPDATED CONCEPT & COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SUMMARY**

---

**Moved: Cr Zhang****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council.

1. Endorses the updated concept plan as seen in attachment 1 and supports the commencement of the detail design; and
2. Notes the community feedback provided within the Community Engagement report in attachment 2.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.10 MACKIE ROAD RESERVE PLAYSPACE - UPDATED CONCEPT & COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SUMMARY**

---

**Moved: Cr Cade****Seconded: Cr Zhang**

That Council.

1. Endorses the play space concept plan and authorises the commencement of detail design; and
2. Notes the community feedback provided, as detailed within the Community Engagement report in attachment 2.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.11 SALE OF COUNCIL LAND ABUTTING 204 CENTRE ROAD BENTLEIGH**

---

**Moved: Cr Cade****Seconded: Cr Zhang**

That Council:

1. notes that no submissions have been received as part of the community engagement,
2. resolves under section 114 of the *Local Government Act 2020* to sell the Land known as Certificate of Title Volume 12209 Folio 008 and shown as part of Lot 1 on Title Plan 963080 (Attachment 1), to the adjoining owner at 204 Centre Road Bentleigh, and
3. authorises the Chief Executive Officer to execute all documentation associated with the sale of the Land.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.12 APPOINTMENT OF MEMBERS TO THE STRATEGIC TRANSPORT ADVISORY COMMITTEE**

---

**Moved: Cr Zmood****Seconded: Cr Pennicuik**

That Council:

1. appoints Hayden Lavigne, Lachlan Smith, Dean Richards, Ellen Martin, Naomi Cooper, Mark Wallace, Madiha Ansari, and Bridget Cramphorn as community representatives to Council's Strategic Transport Advisory Committee for a two-year term.
2. writes to both the successful and unsuccessful applicants providing the outcome of their application.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.13 VCAT WATCH**

---

**Moved: Cr Cade****Seconded: Cr Zmood**

That Council notes the update on Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal matters.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

---

**8.14 APPOINTMENT OF ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER**

---

**Moved: Cr Zmood****Seconded: Cr Parasol**

That Council makes the following appointment to the role of Acting Chief Executive Officer during the absence of the Chief Executive Officer on leave:

- Niall McDonagh, Director Sustainability Assets and Leisure for the period 5pm on Thursday 30<sup>th</sup> November to 5pm on Tuesday 12<sup>th</sup> December 2023 inclusive.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**



**9. URGENT BUSINESS**

Nil

**10. ORDINARY BUSINESS**

**10.1 Requests for reports from a member of Council staff**

Nil

**10.2 Right of reply**

Nil

**10.3 Notice of Motion**

Nil

**10.4 Councillor questions**

Nil

**10.5 Written public questions to Council**

Heard at an earlier stage of the meeting

**11. CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS**

Nil

**12. CLOSURE OF MEETING**

The meeting closed at 9.32pm.

Confirmed this 28 November 2023

**Chairperson.....**